"Surah" Iman [Faith] – A Refutation

<< Return to Quran Challenge Index

Introduction:

The following 'surah' is a Christian Response to the Qur'an Literary Challenge, from the christian site; SuraLikelt.com.

We will quote the 'surah' produced, and provide our commentary below it, insha' Allah.

'Surah' Iman [Faith]:

سبورة الإيمان

واذكرْ في الكتاب الحواريين إذ عصفت الريامُ بهِ مهاية المسيم ليبة وهُم يُبْحُرون (۱) إذ تراّي على المياه لهُمُ طيفُ المسيم وهُم يبهشي، فقالوا أهو ربنا يهاي المياه لهُمُ طيفُ المسيم يبهشي، فقالوا أهو ربنا يهزأ بنا أم قد مسنا ضربْ من جُنون (۲) فجاء هُم صوتُ المعلِّم أنْ لا تخافوا إني أنا في وأفلا تُبورونْ (۳) فهتف هاتف منهم يقولُ ربني مُرني إن كنت حقاً هو، آتي على المياه إلي ولتكُنْ للناس آية الله شَكِّي بيقين (٤) قالَ فاسع إلي ولتكُنْ للناس آية لعلَّم سم يتذكَّرون (٥) وإذ طَقِقُ الحواريُّ يهشي رأى شيد قُق الريح فخاف وبدأ يغرَقُ فصام بربه يسمت عين (٢) فمد بيمينه له فأخذه بما وقال با قليل الإيمان هذا جزاء المُم تريين (٧) وإذ ركب السيفينة معه سكنت جزاء المُم تريين (٧) وإذ ركب السيفينة معه سكنت الريامُ لتوها فسيب الحواريون بحمده ، وهتفوا له قائلين ل (٨) أنت هو أبينُ اللَّعه حقاً ، بكنونُ آمنوا ولم وأمامكن ذر ساجدين (٩) قال طوبي للذين آمنوا ولم وأمامك نذر ساجدين (٩) قال عوبي للذين آمنوا ولم

And make mention of the disciples in the Book, when the wind blew

while they were sailing at night. (1)

{wadhkur filkitabbil hawari-yeena idha asafatir ri-yahoo bihem laylan wahum yubhiroon}

And then it appeared to them seeing the phantom of Christ walking on the

water. They said: Is He our Lord deriding us or have we gone insane? (2)

{Idh tara'a lahum alal mi-yahee tayful Maseehee yamshee fakaloo a'huwa rabbuna yahza'oo bina am kad massana tayfun min junoon.}

And there came the voice of the Master announcing to them: Do not fear, It is I, Don't you see. (3)

{faja'ahumu sawtul-mu'allimi an la takhafoo inni ana huwa
afala tubsiroon?}

Hence, one of them shouted and asked: My Lord, order me, if you

were He, to walk toward you on the water, So God may convert my

doubt to certitude. (4)

{fahatafa hatifon minhumu yakooloo rabbi murni in kunta hakkan huwa atee alal miyahee elayka asa an yubaddilal'lahoo shalli biyakeen}

He $\{ \mbox{The Lord} \}$ said to him, come toward me and be a miracle for man

that they may remember. (5)

{kala fas'a elay'ya walitakun linnasi ayatan la'allahumu yatadhakkaroon}

And as the disciple began to walk, he saw how strong the wind was

so he became afraid and began to drown. Thus he yelled asking his

lord to help. (6)

{wa'idh tafikal hawari'yoo yamshee ra'a shiddatar'reehi fakhafa wabada'a yaghrakoo fasa'ha birabbihee yasta'een.}

And He {The Lord} extended His hand to him and took him with it and

said: Oh you who has little faith, such is the reward of those
who

doubt. (7)

{famadda biyameenihi lahoo fa'akhadhahoo biha wakala ya kalilal imani hadha jaza'ool mumtareen}

And as soon as He went on the ship with him the wind calmed down and

the disciples thanked Him with praise and shouted and said:

```
(8)
    {wa idh rakibas safinata ma'ahoo sakanatir riyahoo lita'wiha
        fasabbahal hawari'yoona bihamdihee wahatafoo lahoo ka'ileen}

You are truly the Son of God; in you we believed and in front of you
we kneel. (9)
    {anta huwab'nullahi hakkan fika nahnoo amanna wa'amamka
        nakhurroo sajideen}

He said: Joy is for those who believed without mixing their faith
with a doubt for those are truly the successful. (10)
```

{kala tooba lilladheena amanoo walam yulbisoo imanahumu

bishakken fa'oola'ika humul muflihoon}

1 - Incorrect Plagiarism of:

Our Refutation:

Wa-dhkur fi-'l-Kitaab [وَاذْكُرْ فِي الْكِتَابِ] – And (also) mention in the Book...

The 'surah' Iman starts with a famous Qur'anic expression that is;

"Wa-dhkur fi-'l-Kitab" which means: "And (Also) mention in the Book (The story of)..."(please confer to the Qur'an; see <u>surah Maryam 19:16</u>, <u>19:41</u>, <u>19:51</u>, <u>19:54</u> and <u>19:56</u>).

This expression requires presence of previous verses, I think they put this expression to make Muslims feel familiar, thus not rejecting it quickly from the beginning.

What could be used instead:

In fact, there are many other more suitable Qur'anic expressions to plagiarize like;

```
a – Hal ataaka hadeeth [هَلْ أَتَاكَ حَدِيثُ] – Has the story reached you.. (please confer to <u>al Dhariyat 51:24</u> and <u>Nazi'at 79:16</u>) or;
```

b-"Hal ataaka nabaa [هَلْ أَتَاكَ نَبَأً] – has the news reached you?" (Qur'an <u>Saad 38:21</u>).

But all these examples are none but plagiarism, which indicates the challengers inability to bring a better (or even similar) expression.

2 - Incorrect Useage of: Reeh&Riyah - Wind.

```
And make mention of the disciples in the Book, when the wind blew while they were sailing at night. (1)

{wadhkur filkitabbil hawari-yeena idha asafatir ri-yahoo bihem laylan wahum yubhiroon}
```

In the <u>1st verse</u> they erroneously used the word "Riyah" for stormy wind; 'Riyah' refers to the wind that brings a blessing while 'Reeh' refers to the stormy wind or that associated with punishment.

So they should have used the word 'Reeh' [stormy/violent wind].

Qur'an and Sunnah Examples of Reeh and Riyah:

'Reeh'[punishment/violent wind] is mentioned in the Qur'an; see; <u>lbrahim 14:18</u>, <u>Fussilat 41:86</u>, <u>Dhariyat 51:43</u>, <u>Qamar 54:19</u> and <u>Haaqqah 69:6</u>.

'Riyah'[blessed wind] is mentioned in; Qur'anal Hijr 15:22.

The Messenger of God (peace be upon him) used to say when the wind came (with the meaning):

"O God! make it Riyah [blessed wind] and not Reeh.

[punishing wind]"

Repeated Error:

One expects that they should at least know how to use Arabic, this mistake is repeated again in verse 8, while in verse 6 they used the word 'Reeh' which indicates their ignorance of correct usage of this little Arabic word.

This is a very embarrassing flaw because no educated Arab should make it.

'Surah' Iman:

Verse 6 - CORRECT:

```
And as the disciple began to walk, he saw how strong the wind was
so he became afraid and began to drown. Thus he yelled
asking his
lord to help. (6)
{wa'idh tafikal hawari'yoo yamshee ra'a shiddatar'reehi fakhafa
wabada'a yaghrakoo fasa'ha birabbihee yasta'een.}
```

Verse 8 - WRONG:

And as soon as He went on the ship with him the wind calmed down and

the disciples thanked Him with praise and shouted and said: (8)

{wa idh rakibas safinata ma'ahoo sakanatir **riyah**oo lita'wiha fasabbahal hawari'yoona bihamdihee wahatafoo lahoo ka'ileen}

<u>Verse 6</u> was linguistically **correct** (since Reeh was used to show a Powerful wind.)

However; Verse 8 was linguistically wrong - since the word Riyah was used = a Calm wind.

Translation:..the calm wind [riyaah] calmed down...

This is <u>not correct</u> since the Author is describing a powerful wind - reeh (mentioned in verse 6) calming down [into riyah].

3 – Use of Comical Expressions:

All above criticism can be easily fixed through re-edition, but what about comic expressions like "Tayf-ul-Masih Yamshi" in verse 2, "Tafaqa Al-Hawwari Yamshi", "Fa khaf wa bad'a Yaghraq" in verse 6 and others?!

4 - Lack of Smoothness/Flow in Recitation:

In addition to many crippled expressions that pop up causing marked disharmony, one does not feel the smoothness of the Qur'an in this forged surah.

It would be interesting for someone to recite this 'surah' Iman on audio and compare it to Qur'anic recitation.

5 – <u>Unnecessary Words - could easily be Removed - without altering it's Meaning.</u>

You can notice how many (unnecessary) details are present in 'surah' Iman, especially when compared with concentrated Qur'anic narration.

<u>Words which could be Removed</u> from 'surah' Iman, without altering it's meaning:

Ayah 1: 'bi HiM' [with them] in verse 1,

Ayah 2: 'la HuM' [for them] in verse 2,

Avah 4: 'min hum' [from them] in verse 4 (in fact the entire verse can be

summerized to the half without any change in meaning),

Ayah 8: 'ma'a hu' [with him] and 'la hu' [for him] in verse 8,

Ayah 9: 'nahn' [we] and 'amama-k' [in front (of) you] in verse 9.

Words/Phrases which could be Summarized:

In Ayah 7: One reads;

And He {The Lord} extended His hand to him and took him with it and

said: Oh you who has little faith, such is the
reward of those who
doubt. (7)

{famadda biyameenihi lahoo fa'akhadhahoo biha wakala ya kalilal

imani hadha jaza'ool mumtareen)

"then he stretched his right (hand) to him, then he took him with it."

<u>Can't they just write</u> "Then he took him with his right (hand)."?!! - [اليمنى -fa akhadhahu bi yadihi-'l yameen]

Unsuitable words:

In addition to lack of smoothness and ease, there is unnecessary use of unsuitable words like 'miyah' for water and 'tara'a' - see or view in verse 2.

6 – The Story itself has a Lack of Thematic Connection & Meaning:

The story itself is weak and unlinked to each other in Lessons;

Brief Summary of 'Surah' Iman;

- 1 First disciples sought a sign that is walking on water,
- 2 then we read that the disciple was about to drown and
- 3 Finally we read that the disciples praised him for a completely different reason other than walking on water, that is the stopping of the wind!

This is unlike the Qur'an which has one main Thematic message in each surah, with passages and words of the aayaat working with each other to enhance that main message [see the tafsirs' on LinguisticMiracle.com Index for examples of Quranic surahs'.].

No verses or words combined together to enhance the conclusion of surah Iman. Rather, it was only like a linear story.

7 - Plagiarisms' from the Aayaat of the Qur'an:

I'll try to enlist plagiarized Qur'anic expressions' in surah Iman;

Surah Iman;

A -in <u>verse 1</u>, "wa-dhkur fel-kitab" [وَاذْكُرْ فِي الْكِتَابِ] - "and mention in the Book.."

see it's mention in Qur'an; surah Maryam 19:16, 19:41, 19:51,19:54 and 19:56

B - in verse 3, "inni ana howa" - Surely I am him..

Animitation of the Qur'an when Allah says to Moses;

Inni ana Allah - [إِنِّي أَنَا اللَّهُ]-Surely I am Allah.. [Qassas 28:30, Taha 20:14]

and

"afla tubsiroun" [أَفَلَا تُبْصِرُونَ] — Do you not see?

See the same phrase in; Qur'an - surah Zukhruf 43:51, Dhariyat 51:21

C - in verse 4,

"hatafa hatefon" - "shouted a shouter."

َ قَالَ قَائِلٌ] - Qaala Qaa'ilun – "Said a Saver.."

[said in; surah Yusuf 12:10, Kahf 18:19, Saffat 37:51], A similar style of speech has been copied from the Qur'an.

and

<u>Verse 4</u>: "'asaan yuBaddiLa Allah... - Perhaps Allah will change (something)..

The Qur'an has a similar phrase;

'asa Rabbuna an yuBDiLa [عُنيَة رَبُّنَا أَن يُبْدِلَ]—Perhaps our Lord will change (something).. [Qalam 68:32]

D - in <u>verse 5</u>, mostly the whole verse is composed of different plagiarized expressions.

He {The Lord) said to him, come toward me and be a miracle for man that they may remember. (5)

{kala fas'a elay'ya walitakun linnasi ayatan la'allahumu yatadhakkaroon}

Kala [(He) قَالَ -Said] – a common statement said in the Qur'an at the beginning of aayaat.

[see; <u>al A'raf 7:12, 7:13, 7:14, 7:15, 7:16,</u> al <u>Baqarah 2:33,</u> and much more examples.]

Fas'a elayya - come to me.

Similar to the Qur'an - surah <u>Jumu'ah 62;9</u> - **Fas'aw elaa** dhikrillah = come to the remembrance of Allah.

Wa li ta-kun <u>ayatan lin-naas</u> – and you be a sign for mankind.

Similar to Qur'an – surah al <u>Fat-h 48:20</u> – wa li ta-koon aayaatan lil mu'mineen [وَلِتَكُونَ آيَةً لِّـلْمُؤْمِنِينَ] – and it be a sign for the believers.

La'al-lahum yaTa-dhakkaroon – that [perhaps] they may remember

"A sign for mankind – that [perhaps] they may remember." [Baqarah 2:221] [آيَاتِهِ لِلنَّاسِ لَعَلَّهُمْ يَتَذَكَّرُونَ]

E - in verse 6;

"berabbihi ya**Sta'een**" – by his Lord, he turned **for help**.

Similar words to surah al Fatiha in the Qur'an;

إِيَّاكَ نَ**سْتَعِينُ**

and You [God] we ask for help. [Fatiha 1:5] – wa iyyaaka naSta'een

F - in verse 7,

"hatha jazaa-ul-mumtareen" – this is the reward of the doubters.

Similar to a common phrase in the Qur'an;

َ الْكَافِرِين]- dhalika **jazaa'-ul** kaafireen – **that**[hell] **is the** reward of the disbelievers.

G - in verse 8,

"sabbaha behamdeh" – glorified.. praised.

Similar to;

[فَسَبِّحْ بِحَمْدِ رَبِّكَ] - fa **s**a**b**bi**h** be**hamd**i Rabbik – then **glorify** and **praise** your Lord. [Qur'an - <u>Nasr 110:3</u>]

H - in verse 10,

He said: Joy is for those who believed without mixing their faith with a doubt for those are truly the successful. (10)

{kala tooba lilladheena amanoo walam yulbisoo imanahumu

bishakken fa'oola'ika humul muflihoon}

<u>Verse 10</u>: wa lam yulbisoo imanahum bi shakken – and do not clothe their belief with doubt.

Similar to the Qur'an; [وَلَمْ يَلْبِسُوا إِيمَانَهُم بِظُلْم]-wa lam yalbisoo imanahum bi Dhulm – and do not clothe their belief with wrongdoing. [An'am 6:82]

and another example from surah Iman;

<u>Verse 10</u>: fa'oola'ika hum-ul muflihoon – then it is they who are the successful

Similar to the Qur'an; [أُو ْ لَكُ الْمُفْلِحُونَ]- wa'oola'ika hum-ul muflihoon and it is they who are the successful. [Imraan 3:104]

The Beginning Verse, and the Last Verse were Plagiarised from the Qur'an Purposelly:

Verse 1 started with an expression from the Qur'an which was plagiarized (although Incorrectly), so the challengers opened the surah with plagiarism and ended it with plagiarism of speech from Qur'an (in verse 10.)

This was purposely done to make us feel that it was Qur'anic from the beginning of it's recital, and to end it with a Qur'anic phrase – to make it feel like a Qur'anic surah right at it's end.

A Big Jazak Allahu khayr to brother Moumen.

<< Return to Quran Challenge Index